Short baseline experiments and sterile neutrinos

Nick van Remortel Solvay-Francqui Workshop on Neutrinos May 27-29 2015



Research Foundation Flanders Opening new horizons

foundation of public utility









Overview

- Tensions with 3 neutrino paradigm by range of experiments \rightarrow sterile neutrinos
- Cosmological bounds
- Mutual tension between experiments
- Prospects for near future
- The SoLid experiment at SCK-CEN

Tensions ³

 B. Kayser @ Moriond EW 2012:arXiv: 1207.2167
 "Not all of the neutrino data are successfully described by the standard three-neutrino paradigm. ...

...there are <u>hints</u>, <u>coming from a variety of sources</u>, that nature may contain more than three neutrino mass eigenstates, and squared-mass splittings significantly larger than the measured $|\Delta m_{21}^2|$ and $|\Delta m_{32}^2|$. Whether individually or taken together, these <u>hints are not convincing</u>. However, they are <u>interesting enough to call for further</u>, hopefully conclusive, <u>investigation</u>"

Sterile neutrinos ⁴

- Experimental observation of short-baseline oscillations suggest at least one extra v mass eigenstate with relatively large mass splitting $|\Delta m|^2 \gtrsim 0.1 \ eV^2$
- If confirmed & combined with Z decay properties this implies the existence of an electroweak singlet v state which is dubbed `sterile'
- Sterile v's can couple no non-SM particles and are valid candidates for (warm) dark matter
- Sterile v's can be easily incorporated in the SM Lagrangian via introduction of Dirac and/or Majorana mass terms

Bounds from Planck ⁵

 CvB decoupled at T=1MeV (~2 second old universe)

2 - (2)

 $\Omega_{\nu}h^2 = \frac{\sum m_{\nu}}{\Omega_{4,1}}$

• Current temperature of CvB

$$T_{\nu} = \left(\frac{4}{11}\right)^{1/3} T_{\gamma} \approx 1.945 K \to k T_{\nu} \approx 1.68 \cdot 10^{-4} eV$$

Number density/flavor For relativistic plasma

Extra radiation component

If non-relativistic

$$n_{f} = \frac{5}{4} \frac{\zeta(5)}{\pi^{2}} g_{f} T_{f}^{3} \to n_{\nu_{k}, \overline{\nu}_{k}} \approx 0.1827 \cdot T_{\nu}^{3} \approx 112 cm^{-3}$$

$$\Omega_{\nu} h^{2} = \frac{7}{4} \left(\frac{4}{11}\right)^{4/3} N_{eff}^{\nu} \Omega_{\gamma} h^{2} \qquad \text{Standard Model predicts:} \\ N_{eff}^{\nu} = 3.046$$

Changing Neff changes expansion rate at recombination Inversely proportional to small angular scale anisotropy CMB also slightly sensitive to $\sum m_{\nu i}$

Bounds from Planck⁶



Bounds from Planck⁷

[Planck 2013 results.XVI.]

 $N_{\rm eff}$

4.0

3.5

0.0



1.2

1.8

 $m_{\nu,\,\rm sterile}^{\rm eff}\,[eV]$

0.6

2.4

- assumption: 3 active neutrinos coexisting with extra massless species
- $\sum m_{\nu}$ and N_{eff} different impact on CMB: **no significant correlation**
- results adding **BAO**:

$$N_{\text{eff}} = 3.32 \pm 0.27 \ (68\% CL)$$

 $\sum m_{\nu} < 0.28 \text{ eV} \ (95\% CL)$

$$m_{\nu,\text{sterile}}^{\text{eff}} = (\Delta N_{\text{eff}})^{3/4} m_{\text{sterile}}^{\text{thermal}}$$

- for low N_{eff} unconstrained within $\Omega_c h^2$
- for $m_{\text{sterile}}^{\text{thermal}} < 10 \text{ eV}$ $N_{\text{eff}} < 3.91$ $m_{\nu,\text{sterile}}^{\text{eff}} < 0.59 \text{ eV}$

M. Spinelli, Neutrino 2014

(same results valid for

0.112

0.104

0.096

0.088

Bounds from BBN⁸

- Abundance of light elements largely driven by total baryon/proton ratio
- But:
 - Electron neutrino's determine proton/neutron ratio
 - Change in expansion rate influences neutron/proton ratio
 - Abundance of helium most sensitive to $\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{eff}}$

Model	Data	Neff	Ref.
$\eta + N_{eff}$	$\eta_{CMB} + Y_p + D/H$	$3.8^{(+0.8)}_{(-0.7)}$	[331]
	$\eta_{CMB} + Y_p + D/H$	< (4.05)	[<u>332</u>]
		3.85 ± 0.26	[333]
	$Y_{\rm p}$ +D/H	3.82 ± 0.35	[333]
		3.13 ± 0.21	[333]
$\eta + N_{eff}, (\Delta N_{eff} \equiv N_{eff} - 3.046 \ge 0)$	η_{CMB} +D/H	3.8 ± 0.6	[122]
	$\eta_{CMB} + Y_p$	$3.90^{+0.21}_{-0.58}$	[122]
	$Y_{\rm p}$ +D/H	$3.91_{-0.55}^{+0.22}$	[122]
K. N. Abazajian et al. ArXiv:12	04.5379v1 [h	ep-	

Global fits to SB Accelerator data ⁹

Appearance data

Disappearance data



Global SBA fits¹⁰

- Very narrow overlaps in detected signals
- Disappearance probability is quadratically suppressed by (small) appearance amplitudes

$$\sin^2 2\theta_{\mu e} \approx 4 \sin^2 2\theta_{ee} \sin^2 2\theta_{\mu \mu}$$

• Forementioned tension can be (artificially) relaxed by considering 3+2, 1+3+1 scenarios $P_{\nu_{\alpha} \rightarrow \nu_{\beta}}^{\text{SBL},3+2} = 4 |U_{\alpha 4}|^2 |U_{\beta 4}|^2 \sin^2 \phi_{41} + 4 |U_{\alpha 5}|^2 |U_{\beta 5}|^2 \sin^2 \phi_{51} + 8 |U_{\alpha 4} U_{\beta 4} U_{\alpha 5} U_{\beta 5}| \sin \phi_{41} \sin \phi_{51} \cos(\phi_{54} - \gamma_{\alpha \beta})$



Short Baseline Reactor ¹¹

- Fission reactors are intense source of $\overline{v_e}$: ${}^{235}_{92}U + n \rightarrow X_1 + X_2 + 2n$ (200MeV)
 - $\rightarrow 6 \ \overline{v_e} \text{ per fission} \rightarrow 2.10^{20} \text{ n/s/GW}_{th}$
 - $2x \ 3$ beta decays distributed over hundreds of possible β -decay branches
 - $\overline{v_e}$'s generally detected via inverse β -decay: $\overline{v_e} + p \rightarrow e^+ + n$ (1.8 MeV energy treshold)
 - (only) 4 fissile isotopes produce v_e 's above IBD treshold: ^{235}U , ^{238}U , ^{239}Pu , ^{241}Pu
- First direct observation of $\overline{v_e}$ by Cowan & Reines at Savannah River power plant: Science 124, 103 (1956).
- Followed by many measurements in 1980's and '90's at Savannah River, Goesgen, Rovno, Bugey, ILL



$\overline{v_e}$ flux calculation and reactor anomaly

• Ab initio computing: 1000's of decay branches computed analytically with input on branching fractions from nuclear databases, and using MCNP MC to track burnup and activity of each isotope over time: \rightarrow predicts electron and $\overline{v_e}$ spectra in rather model independent way

Th. A. Mueller, et al., Phys. Rev C 83, 054615 (2011)

 $\overline{v_e}$ spectrum predicted with ~10% accuracy, dominated by missing experimental data on exotic nuclei and pandemonium effects



$\overline{v_e}$ flux calculation and reactor anomaly¹³

- Lots of high precision electron energy spectra available for pure fissile isotopes \rightarrow conversion of measured e-spectra into predicted $\overline{v_e}$ spectra: Fit ~ 30 slices of endpoints to iteratively extract ~ 30 component $\overline{v_e}$ spectra via $E_v = E_0 - E_e$
- Combine ab-initio with fitting and inclusion of much more branches to obtain best prediction: uncertainties smaller and 3% systematic shift wrt precision reference data: Th. A. Mueller, et al., Improved predictions of reactor antineutrino spectra, Phys. Rev C 83, 054615 (2011)



$\overline{v_e}$ flux calculation and reactor anomaly¹⁴

- Lots of high precision electron energy spectra available for pure fissile isotopes \rightarrow conversion of measured e-spectra into predicted $\overline{v_e}$ spectra: Fit ~ 30 slices of endpoints to iteratively extract ~ 30 component $\overline{v_e}$ spectra via $E_v = E_0 - E_e$
- Combine ab-initio with fitting and inclusion of much more branches to obtain best prediction: uncertainties smaller and 3% systematic shift wrt precision reference data:

P. Huber, Determination of antineutrino spectra from nuclear reactors, Phys. Rev C 84, 024617 (2011)



Reactor anomaly ¹⁵

0.6

ROVNO88 3S

ROVNO88_1S

18.2 m ROVNO88 2S

0.7

0.8

0.9

1.1

1.2

0.938

0.959

1.3

±0.008 ±0.068

±0.009 ±0.075

±0.009 ±0.07

+0.009 +0.06

±0.008 ±0.063

±0.010 ±0.038

+0.006 +0.035

±0.010 ±0.046

+0.059 +0.048

+0.043 +0.05

±0.024 ±0.05

±0.023 ±0.058

±0.115 ±0.044

0.000 +0.020

1.4

0.004

±0.022

1.3

1.4

- G. Mention et al., Reactor antineutrino anomaly, Phys.Rev.D 83, 073006 (2011), confirmed by P. Huber Phys.Rev.C 84, 024617 (2011)
- Previous improved $\overline{v_e}$ spectra show 3% underestimation of \bullet integrated flux
- Improved neutron lifetime increases IB ightarrow
- Total predicted detectable flux increases by 3.5%



Reactor anomaly¹⁶



Constraints from LBR¹⁷

 Daya Bay coll, "Search for a Light Sterile Neutrino at Daya Bay", PRL 113, 141802 (2014)



 Gallium Anomaly ¹⁸
 Radiochemical experiments GALLEX (Phys. Lett. B 420 (1998) 114, Phys. Lett. B 685 (2010) 47) & SAGE (Phys. Rev. C 59 (1999) 2246)



• Calibrated with β -sources (⁵¹Cr, ³⁷Ar)



All observed a **deficit** of neutrino interactions **compared** to the **expected activity:**

R = meas./pred. rates = 0.86 ± 0.06(1 σ)

Reactor data only

Combined fits 19

Reactor + Gallium



- Combined no oscillation disfavored at more than 99.9% C.L.
- Significance of best fit ~ 3.3 σ

GLOBAL fits of SBA, reactor&Gallium



- Severe tensions between disappearance & appearance data, between null results and signals
- Only 2 $|\Delta m_4|^2$ values around 0.9 and 6 eV² preferred



Reactor experiment requirements²²

- High flux \rightarrow High Thermal power
- Compact core: diam < 1 m
- Small flux model uncertainties: pure & enriched fuel
- Approachable to d<10m
- Low backgrounds
- Fine detector segmentation and good energy resolution to allow E/L measurements
- High CC detection efficiency

Impact of key exp. parameters



New reactor experiments 24

Name	Det	Size [# × l]	ΔE @MeV	BL [m]	Rate [1/d]	Effi [%]
SBL Korea	Gd-LS	1×700	6%	27	900	40
Neutrino-4	Gd-LS	2×800	100 pe/PM	6-13		
STEREO	Gd-LS	6×300	400 pe	8.811.2 1012.4	410 _{det}	60
Prospect	LS Li	140×20	10%	7.9		30
		10k		17.9		
DANSS	PS Gd	2.5k×0.4	24%	9.7↔12.2	10k	
SoLid	PS Li	23k×0.125	17%	5.511	416 _{det} /t @6.8m	41

Torsten Soldner – ILL

NuPhys2014: Sterile Neutrinos @ Reactors

19

6





SoLid experiment overview ²⁶



- Source: SCK-CEN BR2 MTR reactor
 - **45-70 MWth** power, 150 days/year
 - Relatively low level of reactor background
- Baseline L = 6.8m (center detector)
- 2.88 tonnes fiducial mass
- Modest passive shielding
- 416 reconstructed evts/day
- E resolution = 17%
- Data taking in early 2016



- IBD efficiency 41% at 600keV treshold
- 300 days running at 6.8m baseline
- flux normalisation (4.1%), detector efficiency (2%) systematics and backgrounds (S:B ~ 5-6)
 large bins to account for energy
- smearing effects

SoLid collaboration formed sept 2014











27



Tech

Virginia











- •Tank in Pool MTR research reactor
- •Licensed to run at power up to 100 MW
 - -variable operating power
 - -5/6 cycles per year
 - -low reactor backgrounds

Universiteit Antwerpen

SCK•CEN BR2



on axis with reactor





Beryllium matrix and assemblies

20

Detector principle²⁹

$$\bar{\nu}_e + p \rightarrow e^+ + n$$





- Neutron / gamma-ray discrimination from pulse
 - distinctive response for prompt and delayed signal
 - neutron used to trigger event read out
- Voxelisation of target volume
 - neutron captured in neighboring cube increasing localisation of IBD event

Technology& Design





30



Advantages³¹

- Very compact and highly efficient detector:
 - Spatial resolution of 5 cm!
 - energy resolution: 10-17%
 - Movable over distance to core between 6-15m
 - Extendable by adding more planes
 - Very high background rejection due to
 - Time and topological signature of true $\overline{v_e}$ signals
 - Additional shielding
 - Already operating in low background environment



Staged design³²

- Started with 8 kg prototype in dec 2013
- Finished construction of 288 kg full scale module in Nov 2014
- Planned (and funded) construction of a 1.4 T detector by summer 2016
- If more funding secured: Extension with 2nd station of 1.4 T

NEMENIX 8kg prototype³³

Purposes:

- Proof of composite scintillator concept
- Develop reconstruction techniques
- Measure backgrounds at experimental location
- TRL 2 3





N. Ryder @ Workshop Applied Antineutrino Physics 2014

SM1 288 kg module³⁴

Purposes:

- $80 \times 80 \times 45 \text{ cm}^3$
- Proof of event topology concept
- Measure $\bar{\nu_e}$ energy spectrum
- Compare measured and calculated flux and spectrum
- Demonstrate reactor monitoring
- Scale up production, DAQ, etc.
- Improve reconstruction, analysis
- TRL 3 5



N. Ryder @ Workshop Applied Antineutrino Physics 2014

Construction of SM1³⁵

- UAntwerpen, UGent & VUB :
- 3000 cubes machined & assembled in 3,5 months time
- Cosmic Muon veto system built & tested
- Mechanical design + financing materials: SUBATECH Nantes









Construction of SM1³⁶

- Electronics: Oxford & Bristol
 - 300 MPPC sensors coupled to 300 optical fibers
 - 10 amplifier&digitizer boards, 5 DAQ modulel



Deployment at SCK³⁷



First results ³⁸ Cosmic muon tracks and dE/dx





- Allow to calibrate uniformity of gains in channels
- Estimate energy scale and resolution

First results³⁹

• Channel gain calibration



• Energy scale



Several methods with varying complexity



Physics potential of Phase 1⁴¹

- Opportunity for precision measurement of flux at <d>=5.8m with 1-2 cycles
- Dominated by systematics
- Before most (or all) other experiments
- Measure rate difference at two values of d (5.5-6m)
- Measure E difference at two values of d
- Reactor flux calculation:
 - Will determine spectrum





Current status⁴²

- 8kg prototype: ~60 days of reactor ON data under analysis: hints of significant excess of $\overline{v_e}$ candidates \rightarrow to be published soon
- 288 kg demonstrator:
 - ~10 days of good quality reactor ON data should allow first flux measurement at ~5.5 m distance (uncovered terrain), perhaps first energy spectrum
 - Currently calibrated with cosmics, γ and n sources
- 1.4 T station under construction, to be finished by summer 2016
- Next BR2 cycle expected for Aug 2016

Conclusion⁴³

- Lots of conflicting data in search for short baseline oscillations
- Sterile neutrinos still viable portal for new physics
- New generation of improved SB accelerator and reactor experiments being staged
- Belgian BR2 reactor and SoLid experiment seem to be at front line for reactor based sterile neutrino searches

Backup



Other SB Reactor experiments⁴⁵



NuPhys2014: Sterile Neutrinos @ Reactors

From: T. Soldner at nuPhys 2014, London Universiteit Antwerpen



Hot off the press: PROSPECT2 operating @ HFIR

~2 liter Li-LS detector in small Bpoly/ lead shield

- not representative of final shield design but useful for MC validation







⁶Li and fast neutron PSD strongly suppress backgrounds

Studies Underway:

- Muon correlations
- Detailed simulation comparison
- Internal background contribution (Rx off)

10Hz Rx On singles rate > 200keV -several orders of magnitude reduction with more to come

From N. Bowden at AAP workshop, Paris 2014

NUCIFER @ OSIRIS and STEREO @ ILL⁴⁸

Main caracteristics of NUCIFER :

- 850 L of Gd-loaded (0.2%) liquid scintillator (MPIK scintillator),
- 16 PMTs fixed on an acrylic buffer,
- central calibration tube,
- ~7 m from a 70 MW_{th} "pool type" research reactor.

STEREO

- Six cells (40×90×90) cm³ filled with Gd-loaded liquid scintillator.
- Surrounding crown filled with unloaded liquid scintillator.
 - Containment of energy leakage
 - Active veto of external background
- Light collection :
 - Four PMTs per cell and acrylic buffer.
 - Acrylic walls and optical segmentations with VM200.







Backgrounds at various facilities⁵⁰ PROSPECT @ NIST







6

Radioactive sources

 Plans to place MCi sources inside or near existing v detectors

¹⁴⁴*Ce* at Daya Bay D.A. Dwyer et al., PHYSICAL REVIEW D 87, 093002 (2013)

 10^{2}



¹⁴⁴*Ce*, ⁵¹*Cr* SOX at Borexino G. Bellini et al., JHEP08(2013)038



Short Baseline Accelerator⁵²

- First v anomalies appear in short baseline $\overline{\nu_{\mu}}(\nu_{\mu})$ beam experiments:
 - 2001 LSND Collab.: Evidence for neutrino oscillations from the observation of $\overline{v_e}$ appearance in a $\overline{v_{\mu}}$ beam, Phys. Rev. D64, 112007 (2001). $P(\overline{v_{\mu}} \rightarrow \overline{v_e}) = (0.264 \pm 0.067 \pm 0.045)\%$

implying $|\Delta m_4|^2 > 0.1 eV^2$

- 2002 KARMEN Collab.: Upper limits for neutrino oscillations $\overline{\nu_{\mu}} \rightarrow \overline{\nu_{e}}$ from muon decay at rest, Phys. Rev. D65, 112001 (2002)

Exclude large part (but not all) of parameter space favored by LSND

Short Baseline Accelerator⁵³

- First v anomalies appear in short baseline $\overline{v_{\mu}}(v_{\mu})$ beam experiments:
 - MINIBOONE: Initially no conformation (2007), but more data and re-analysis show excess both in $\overline{\nu_{\mu}} \rightarrow \overline{\nu_{e}}$ and $\nu_{\mu} \rightarrow \nu_{e}$ modes Improved Search for $\overline{\nu_{\mu}} \rightarrow \overline{\nu_{e}}$ Oscillations in the MiniBooNE Experiment, PRL 110, 161801 (2013)
 - MINOS (2005-2012): Long baseline with near (1km) and far (735 km) station, high energy v_{μ} and $\overline{v_{\mu}}$ beam: no evidence of distorted v energy spectrum, using CC+NC events: exclude most of the favored region by LSND+MINIBOONE for $|\Delta m_4|^2 < 1eV^2$
- Overall severe tension between signals in appearance and disappearance data
- Large mixing $\sin^2\theta_{\mu e4} > 10^{-3}$ excluded for $|\Delta m_4|^2 < 1eV^2$

Update from MINOS 54



2014 v_{μ} dissappearance limits, presented by A. Sousa, neutrino 2014, Boston arXiv:1502.07715 [hep-ex]

Follow-up experiments⁵⁵ MINOS+: same Near+far detectors Extended beam intensity&energy, since 2013 Expected limits by 2016

Improve mixing angle sensitivity with factor 2



20/02/15 ake Louise 2015 Thomas Strauss, AEC-LHEP Bern, 56 56 CH LAr Mass In the beaution of the bird MINOS **ICARUS T600** NOV 600m – Far Delector CARUS/T600 MicroBooNE MiniBooNE MicroBooNE NuM Neutrino Boost Beam Neutrin Beam LAr1-ND 110m - Nea SciBooNE 1-ND

BNB Target

20/02/15

Thomas Strauss, AEC-LHEP Bern, 57 57 CH Oscillation Physics

v_{μ} to v_{e} oscillation v_{e} Appearance



v_{μ} to v_{x} oscillation v_{μ} Disappearance



nuSTORM 58

 nuSTORM: proposal for a v factory via stored μ beam, arXiv:1308.6822v1, arXiv:1402.5250v1

